

## Chief Experts Duties & Dept of the Jury Panel

INTRO Although only 1 UK Chief Exp (GK) = Montreal  
we've kept this session as the basis of a description of how a  
jury panel should be managed and as an intro to the next  
session when Barry Roe (dubious exp) will discuss your role

You will receive as hand out checklist, based on rules +  
past experience & practice. Trades disparate

- interpret / apply with imagination

At Montreal no training for all experts - will receive  
a multiple choice questionnaire

Chief experts to be named Pte on 5<sup>th</sup> November

To pass on 15 experts At 6<sup>th</sup> November

I will pick out some key responsibilities of  
chief experts - assisted by Barry, Laurie  
& others

Barry will focus on management of a  
jury panel.

## First instruction to Read

1.5 Prepare proposals for judging teams including

- composition of teams for different elements
- taking account of desirability of ensuring that as far as possible each expert judges the same total value of maximum marks.

Also language mix

mix teams

B/hy?

will have to be negotiated and agreed. Keep records of  
intended & actual teams.

2. Preparatory jury meetings

- 2.1 Check experts in attendance against latest advice from Technical Committee and follow up any discrepancies with jury president.
- 2.2 Confirm languages of experts to establish requirement for interpreters.
- 2.3 Check identity and validity/authority of interpreters allocated to the trade.

contd./



First Meeting with fellow jurors at the arrival day 4/11  
 reception (party). Old experts no problem but  
 if new experts have any difficulties — see me, contact CE, TD.

2.4 Formal welcome to 'old' and 'new' experts. Encourage new experts to become part of the team. Exchange of gifts (Healthcare - Dr. Amy Barber)

language & checking of interpreters accredited what words  
 2.5 Set out prepared work programme for jury to show time available and deadlines for

- project appraisal and possible amendment (without affecting materials required); agreement on detailed marking criteria
- revision of technical description
- selection of projects for subsequent competitions
- inspection of workshop facilities, the first inspection to identify any obvious shortcomings in respect of materials, equipment and workshop safety, the second inspection to confirm compliance with jury requirements established during initial inspection
- actual competition time
- marking of projects
- submission of marks and revised technical description to secretariat
- release of experts only after marks have been checked.

Although this programme may have to be modified in the light of the time available, it is intended to secure the jury's commitment to an agreed work timetable and to make clear to all jury members what is expected of them, since the degree of individual experts' commitment can vary, especially as the competition proceeds. All the elements must be completed **before** the jury is released.

First Key job 2.6

Assessment of the project proposed by the Secretariat for the immediate competition. (or of course as developed by different contributing experts - can't it be done CAD etc)

2.6.1 Discuss the proposed project against the criteria of

- compliance with the technical description
- clarity
- if drawn, submitted in ISO A and ISO E
- relevance to current practice
- capable of being completed by a reasonable percentage of competitors within 22 hours
- adequacy of marking scheme
- need for any essential changes (not involving additional or different materials).

2.6.2 If necessary, delegate revision to a sub-group and, in any case, get agreement of all experts to the project.

2.6.3 Obtain agreement of shop master to any changes.

2.6.4 Identify experts able to translate project into language of their competitor and get that done, including materials lists and any written instructions to competitors.

contd./

2.6.5 Discuss and secure agreement on mark scheme. maximise objective mark element if possible, identify and agree criteria for subjective marking (including 'quasi-objective'), indicate critical dimensions and, if many measurements/elements are possible, decide on which are to be measured/judged or how randomised checks on specific elements will be selected after the project is completed. Agree on how incomplete work should be marked. Check that the total maximum marks do not exceed 100. Write up details of mark scheme for competitors' reference and translate into competitors' languages. Check forms 6 and 5a.

2.6.6 The agreed and translated projects should be handed by the chief expert and jury president to the secretariat for safe keeping and also for any necessary further translation for competitors not represented by an expert, together with

- drawings - with critical dimensions indicated
- material list
- mark scheme
- (checked?) and completed forms 6 and 5a.

2.6.7 Discuss and agree marking procedures. Reinforce point that no 'private' recording of marks.

*whether written or electronic*

- Marking is carried out by small groups of three experts who are to mark all the competitors for that particular element or those elements. It is for the chief expert to assign individuals to these groups taking account of experience, languages spoken and balance - the groups to be recorded on form 6.
- Subjective element marked first against previously identified and agreed criteria. Remind experts that individual marks finally recorded must be within a range of 3 marks (not more than a 2 mark gap). The chief expert may or may not decide to mark.
- Marks awarded within the maximum for that element of the project may be rounded to a maximum of two decimal places.
- Design any marking templates or gauges and arrange for workshop master to provide required materials. Jury team to make these instruments.
- Time spent agreeing the maximum detail at this stage will be more than saved at the marking stage. It is important to ensure that at all stages all experts fully understand what has been discussed and agreed. If necessary, decisions should await the arrival of a translator. To avoid disputes later, it is useful to record all decisions on a flip chart.

contd./



2.6.8 Discuss and secure agreement of jury to a **safety checklist** covering minimum safety requirements for safe working taking account of the **host country's requirements**. A list prepared in advance is useful. Provide this list for workshop master.

2.6.9 Arrange **second inspection** of workshop to

- confirm availability of materials, equipment etc
- carry out safety check against list provided previously to workshop master.

## 2.7 **Revision of technical description**

2.7.1 This is to be done **before** consideration of projects brought for **subsequent competitions**.

2.7.2 The existing technical description should be **critically assessed against the following criteria**

- is **modularised if possible** to enable daily marking, both to increase interest and to shorten final marking process
- **reflects current commercial/ industrial practice** and does not artificially restrict the range of tasks or the use of tools and equipment used
- **includes problem solving, design and innovation as may be required in commercial practice**
- includes **fault finding and rectification** if practised by the trade
- **judged and assessed against commercially realistic standards** with most weight being to **completeness, function and appearance** and less weight to **internal dimensions and working methods**
- **critically reviews the plant and equipment required to be provided by the host country** with a view to reducing this from a maximum to an optimum level.

2.7.3 The **agreed amendments** should immediately be **translated** into the **three official languages** and the master copy in each language **signed** by all the experts ready for submission with forms 6 and 5a at the end of the competition. (Copies should preferably be obtained for each expert.)

## 2.8 **Presentation and selection of test projects suitable for future competitions.**

2.8.1 Certain countries will have agreed to present projects in the three official languages. Other experts **may** bring projects in one language. One copy only is to be brought.

2.8.2 Agree a system of presentation:

- **put on wall or describe individually?**
- **ensure ample time for consideration and questioning;** more important to select good ones than to decide quickly
- **make sure each expert has fair say.**

- 2.8.3 Propose and secure jury agreement on criteria to be employed for selection of proposal taking account of 2.6.1 and 2.7.2 above.
- 2.8.4 Propose and secure jury agreement on selection system using previously agreed criteria, eg short-listing, mark ordering/scoring, secret ballot. A grid table on a flip chart may be helpful in presenting the results.
- 2.8.5 Consider possible desirability of amending or combining projects
- 2.8.6 It is the chief expert's responsibility to ensure that the projects meet the technical description as revised and do not require plant or equipment not included in it.

### 3. Final pre-competition checks

Before competitors arrive check that

- daily timetable has been agreed and is displayed
- final safety checks have been carried out in workshop
- practice materials and equipment are ready
- experts/workshop master have been briefed to carry out any demonstrations on equipment.

### 4. Introduction and practice session (in days before competition)

opening toolboxes

- 4.1 Welcome competitors, introduce experts, explain programme, practice session and familiarisation period.
- 4.2 Allocate workstations by random process and ensure competitors are content and receive answers to legitimate questions in a language they understand. If necessary obtain services of an interpreter.
- 4.3 Check competitors' age against passports or other identity documents. Remember that some countries may not use the Julian calendar; if necessary consult the relevant technical delegate.
- 4.4 Check toolboxes and, in agreement with jury, exclude any equipment 'not in normal use and work practice' as well as any suspect jigs or templates.
- 4.5 Explain timetable for each day and arrangements for competitors, half at a time, to have 2 hours on the second day to see the rest of the competition, or at least some time over the competition. Give this job to a couple of experts, their specific extra task being to keep complete timing records and post them.
- 4.6 Ensure competitors have copies of Form 6 and are aware of the key dimensions to be marked, if this has been decided in advance.
- 4.7 Brief competitors on any special safety arrangements etc. Advise procedure to be followed if an accident occurs.

contd./



- 4.8 Brief competitors on ~~not communicating with own expert except~~ with another expert present. Refer to new disciplinary procedure.
- 4.9 Explain to ~~workshop master~~ and assistants that they must not communicate with or assist any competitor, unless on the direct instruction of the chief expert.
- 4.10 Remind ~~interpreters~~ that they are not allowed to enter the competition area.
- 4.11 Supervise the ~~practice session~~ and ensure that all competitors are happy with the tools and equipment. *CNC much longer than the trade*
- 4.12 Check the competitors' own ~~electrical equipment~~ for safety and that they have relevant personal protective equipment.
- 4.13 Ensure that all used and unused ~~scrap practice material is removed from~~ the workstations.

## 5. During the familiarisation period (on morning of first day of competition)

- 5.1 Collect drawings and instructions from Secretariat and issue to competitors, ensuring that they put their names and work station numbers on drawings.
- 5.2 Ensure that experts are not allocated to their own competitors but otherwise respond to questions on the drawing.
- 5.3 ~~Identify any problems indicated by individual competitors, which may require advice to all competitors.~~
- 5.4 Ensure that all competitors have ~~checked the material allocation~~ against the material list and found this to be correct.
- 5.5 ~~Organise group sessions with competitors to go over any problems.~~ If amendments to the drawing are required, check that they are noted by all competitors.
- 5.6 ~~Advise procedures for and penalties associated~~ with the use of additional materials by competitors.
- 5.7 ~~Explain the procedures to be followed if a competitor has a problem during the competition, reporting it to a non-compatriot expert and recording the time lost.~~
- 5.8 Ensure that all competitors ~~have understood~~ what has been said, if necessary calling in an ~~interpreter~~.

## 6. During the competition

- 6.1 Ensure that all ~~timings~~ (start, lunch break, finish) are strictly adhered to.
- 6.2 ~~Record any time lost~~ and/or extra materials used by competitor.

contd./

*Shaker according to time available*

- 6.3 Adjust individual competitors' timetables to allow for any time lost on a daily basis.
- 6.4 Record any unusual incidents, e.g. accidents.
- 6.5 Prevent unauthorised communication with competitors by outsiders or the compatriot expert (except with a third person present) as well as undue attention or potential supervision by compatriot experts.
- 6.6 Control access to competition area and prevent access by anyone, except team leaders, except with express permission.
- 6.7 Prevent any vocal or other expression of judgement of a competitor's work by any expert.
- 6.8 Ensure that appeals for extra time in respect of defective workstations, materials or equipment or accidental damage by other persons are rapidly resolved with the agreement of all experts.
- 6.9 Arrange for display of project drawings to inform the public, as and when appropriate.
- 6.10 Ensure that all drawings, work in progress, unused materials and, if to be judged, waste materials are collected and properly secured overnight.
- 6.11 Oversee health and safety.
- 6.12 Ensure that all competitors and experts are allowed the allocated time to visit other stands.
- 6.13 On completion of competition congratulate all competitors.
- 6.14 Feedback to competitors on general performance.
- 6.15 Supervise collection of tools and clearance of stand ready for marking.
- 6.16 Allow for photograph session with competitors before they leave the stand.

## 7. Marking

- 7.1 If necessary remind experts of the agreed procedure, including the 1-10 scale, ie what a mark of 3 means etc.
- 7.2 Ensure that all subjective marking is done before objective.
- 7.3 Ensure that there is never a gap of more than 2 points between experts but, if so, the gap is narrowed by discussion.

contd./

To be dealt with by Bernie in next session



- 7.4 Use flash cards unless alternative confidential system agreed.
- 7.5 Use forms 5 and 5a to record marks.
- 7.6 Transfer marks to form 6 for each competitor.
- 7.7 Question consistently lower marking by one expert which may favour that expert's compatriot competitor. This often needs to be done at an early stage of the marking to ensure the problem is properly resolved before moving on.
- 7.8 Do not permit private recording of marks.
- 7.9 With jury president, deliver forms 6 (and forms 5 and 5a) to secretariat, releasing experts only when forms 6 have been approved.

## 8. Further tasks and responsibilities

- 8.1 Although sometimes uncomfortable situations may and will occur, it is important to ensure correct procedures are followed, ~~to register the details and arrive at the~~ remedy. Write down the details and, if possible, get experts to sign.
- 8.2 Refer any problems which cannot be solved to ~~the jury president.~~
- 8.3 Check that duties delegated to specific experts have been carried out.
- 8.4 If possible, a brief review of the competition can be useful to reinforce or even mend relationships between experts and establish ground rules for the next competition.
- 8.5 Ensure that all participating experts, workshop master and assistants are ~~thanked~~ for their efforts, and that the jury president is thanked for his/her support.
- 8.6 Some chief experts find it helpful to keep a ~~diary of significant events~~ and decisions.
- 8.7 ~~Discourage use of mobile phones~~ except where unavoidable.
- 8.8 ~~Disks and personal laptops should not be removed from the competition area during the whole event.~~